Why Assess Professionalism? Unprofessional Behaviour Predictive of Future

Unprofessional Behavior in Medical School and Subsequent Disciplinary Action by State Medical Boards

A Teherani, M Banach, C Hodgson, S Rattner, J Veloski, D Stern, T Knettler

UCSF, University of Michigan, Jefferson Medical College, Federation of State Medical Boards

M Papadakis New Engl J Med 2005

Methods

Design Cases

Case-control study
All graduates disciplined
by any state medical
board (1990-2003) from:

Poor Ability to Self Improve

- Does not solicit feedback
 - Does not incorporate the feedback

Bases of Disciplinary Actions **Disciplinary Actions** Failure to meet educational requirement (e.g. CME) 18 General 16 Fraud/billing/tax irregularities 10 Controlled substance violations 9 Examination/license irregularities 8 Substance use (e.g. self use of drugs/alcohol) 8 Professional conduct 6 Convicted of a crime 5 Sexual misconduct 5

Significant Predictor Variables Odds Ratio Low professionalism score 2 Low ABIM certification exam score 2

How does a selection committee identify applicants to medical school who may be unprofessional?

The largest challenge
Existing personal interview has limited

Two "Respect" Questions

- 1. Treat Me with Respect
 - "I was treated with respect by this attending physician"
- 2. Treat Others with Respect
 - "I observed others (students, residents, staff, patients) being treated with respect by this attending physician"

Student evaluation of "respectful" treatment by faculty at UCSF

This faculty member:

 Failed to treat me with respect and generally displayed an unprofessional or abusive manner in all interactions

to

5. Consistently treated me with respect

Treat me with respect - Reasons

Belittled or humiliated me

Spoke sarcastically or insultingly to me
Intentionally neglected or left me out of the communications

Subjected me to offensive sexist remarks or names

Subjected me to racist or ethically offensive remarks or names

Engaged in discomforting humor

Denied me training opportunities because of my gender

Required me to perform personal services (i.e. babysitting, shopping)

Threw instruments/bandages, equipment etc.

Threatened me with physical harm (e.g. hit, slapped, kicked)

Created a hostile environment for learning